NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006
AASHTO GUIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION LANDSCAPE AND ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN
REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

COMMENT NUMBER	COMMENT LOCATION	COMMENT	ACTION
1	General Overview	Overall, I am very impressed with the quality and content of this draft. Hawaii DOT is beginning its first statewide landscape masterplan and this document will be extremely helpful in our efforts. The references in each section are excellent and thorough. I would also like to commend the writers for a writing style that is enjoyable to read.	
2	General Overview	I would suggest adding sidebars through out the guide that illustrate the various guide tie –ins to stakeholder laws such as Highway Beautification Act, Historic Preservation Act, Federal Aid highway Act, NEPA, ISTEA, etc. This might help the reader see the various ways these suggestions can also help comply with these stakeholder laws.	
3	Chapter 2 page 8-9	The section graphics are too small.	
4	Chapter 2 page 8-10	Maybe add a grid for “Road Class” and “Setting” with bullets that illustrate the main differences?	
5	Chapter 3 page 18	Third paragraph under Safety – might consider referring to the Dutch engineer Hans Monderman. Quite eye opening.	
6	Chapter 4 page 41	Second paragraph - Add image of Bruce Watkins Drive.	
7	Chapter 4 page 41	Third paragraph – might add that roof gardens or green roofs reduce heating/cooling costs and decrease the amount of storm water runoff.	
8	Chapter 4 page 44	Might add that medians being in the center of the road and always on the driver’s side tend to be the most dominant visual element of the road.	

Date: 6/13/08

NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006
AASHTO GUIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION LANDSCAPE AND ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN
REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

9	Chapter 4 page 45	Second paragraph – I have a real concern with this entire paragraph. I talked with the researcher Prof Edward Sullivan and I would prefer this paragraph mention the common sense knowledge of median trees stated in the study "*Most noteworthy is that there are increased proportions of hit-object collisions and decreased proportions of head-on and broadside collisions in the presence of trees.*" The other points mentioned versus number of lives saved from preventing head on collisions does not seem thorough enough to mention in this guide.	
10	Chapter 4 page 49	Under-bridge lighting paragraph - might mention the use of ceramic tiles for better lighting in tunnels and an opportunity for CSS in the design of the tiles.	
11	Chapter 4 page 50	Additional Design Considerations – Might mention that in Hawaii full cutoffs are being required by law on some islands for other reasons – including light pollution to the world class telescopes on Mount Haleakala on Maui and for the protection of an endangered species bird called the Newell's Shearwater bird that is attracted to the lights from the ocean and cause their death. HDOT is systematically replacing all lights with full cutoff lights on some islands.	
12	Chapter 4 page 50	Signs- Are aesthetically enhanced sign supports hit more often than regular sign posts?	
13	Chapter 4 page 50	Signs- suggest adding information on the tendency in urban corridors of having a congestion of signs that compete for the eye and the necessity of a visual hierarchy.	
14	Chapter 4 page 57	Grading – encourage 3d modeling of grading to better understand the aesthetics.	
15	Chapter 4 page 57	Grading – might mention grading should minimize the time of exposed soils to reduce erosion and establishment of invasives/noxious weeds.	
16	Chapter 4 page 58	Hydrology – might add to the caption of the bike lane photo that the drain grates should be carefully considered along bike lanes to minimize bike crashes.	
17	Chapter 4 page 62	Second Paragraph – "…some creatures are better *discourages* along…" should be "…some creatures are better *discouraged* along…"	
18	Chapter 4 page 64	Planting Aesthetics fifth paragraph - might add that plants screening walls reduces graffiti.	

Date: 6/13/08

NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006
AASHTO GUIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION LANDSCAPE AND ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN
REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

19	Chapter 4 page 66	Plant Selection, Sustainability, and Costs last paragraph – might mention that CU Structural Soil allows for the industry standard 95% compaction for use as pavement base.	
20	Chapter 4 page 67	Native plantings – I believe the argument can be made in regions of mostly nonnatives that roads could serve as the vector for the spread of native plants.	
21	Chapter 4 page 68	Managing Vegetation – suggest adding a paragraph on having a proactive hazard tree program to regularly evaluate roadside trees for structural problems that could fall and cause harm to people or property. States with hazard tree programs are better protected in court for having performed due diligence.	
22	Chapter 4 page 79	Pedestrian Facilities 5th paragraph on vegetation - trees on streets serve an additional function of enhancing pedestrian safety from out of control vehicles.	
23	Chapter 4 page 79	Pedestrian Facilities – might mention careful consideration should be made in the location of traffic signal boxes at intersections as they sometimes reduce sight distances for pedestrians.	
24	Chapter 4 page 83	Photo caption "…utilites…" s/b "…utilities…"	
25	Chapter 4 page 84	Utilities top paragraph – designers can also improve visual quality by using decorative utility posts and bundling of the different utility company wires. While electrical utility under grounding tends to be expensive, undergrounding of non electrical utilities can be affordable and reduce visual clutter. Taller posts are another option to create wider spacing of posts and allow larger trees to be installed.	
26			
27			
28			
29			

Date: 6/13/08